# New York Journal of Mathematics

New York J. Math. 17 (2011) 41-49.

# A generalization of Jørgensen's inequality to infinite dimension

### Liulan Li

ABSTRACT. In this paper, we give a generalization of Jørgensen's inequality to hyperbolic Möbius transformations in infinite dimension by using Clifford algebras. We also give an application.

#### Contents

1.	Introduction	41
2.	Preliminaries	42
3.	The main result and its proof	45
4.	An application	47
References		48

#### 1. Introduction

In the theory of discrete groups, the following important and useful inequality is well known as Jørgensen's inequality, see [5].

**Theorem J.** Suppose that  $f, g \in M(\overline{\mathbb{R}}^2)$  generate a discrete and nonelementary group  $\langle f, g \rangle$ . Then

$$|\operatorname{tr}^2(f) - 4| + |\operatorname{tr}([f, g]) - 2| \ge 1.$$

In [4], Hersonsky gave a partial generalization of Theorem J to Möbius transformations in  $\overline{\mathbb{R}}^n$  by using Clifford algebra, which is stated in the following form.

**Theorem H.** Let  $f, g \in M(\overline{\mathbb{R}}^n)$  such that f and [f, g] are hyperbolic, and suppose that  $\langle f, g \rangle$  is a discrete and nonelementary group. Then

$$|\operatorname{tr}^2(f) - 4| + |\operatorname{tr}([f, g]) - 2| \ge 1.$$

Received September 16, 2010.

<sup>2000</sup> Mathematics Subject Classification. Primary: 30F40; Secondary: 20H10.

Key words and phrases. Jørgensen's inequality, Möbius transformation in infinite dimension, Clifford algebra.

The research was supported by the Science and Technology Development Program of Hengyang (No. 2010KJ22) and NSF of Hunan (No. 10JJ4005).

In [12], Waterman generalized Jørgensen's inequality to high dimensional groups and obtained

**Theorem WA.** Let  $f, g \in M(\overline{\mathbb{R}}^n)$ . If  $\langle f, g \rangle$  is discrete and nonelementary, then

$$||f - I|| \cdot ||g - I|| \ge \frac{1}{32}.$$

In [11], Wang also studied the generalization of Jørgensen's inequality to hyperbolic Möbius transformations in high dimension, giving the following generalization of Theorem H.

**Theorem W.** Let  $f, g \in M(\overline{\mathbb{R}}^n)$  such that f is hyperbolic and [f, g] is vectorial, and suppose that  $\langle f, g \rangle$  is a discrete and nonelementary group. Then

$$|\operatorname{tr}^{2}(f) - 4| + |\operatorname{tr}([f, g]) - 2| \ge 1.$$

We refer to [6, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13] for related investigations in this direction. The main aim of this paper is to establish Jørgensen's inequality in the infinite dimensional case. Our main result is Theorem 3.1, which is a generalization of Theorems H and W and a partial generalization of Theorem J to infinite dimension. We will state and prove it in Section 3. In Section 4 we will give an application of Theorem 3.1.

## 2. Preliminaries

The Clifford algebra  $\ell$  is the associative algebra over the real field  $\mathbb{R}$ , generated by a countable family  $\{i_k\}_{k=1}^{\infty}$  subject to the following relations:

$$i_h i_k = -i_k i_h \ (h \neq k), \quad i_k^2 = -1, \quad \forall h, k \ge 1$$

and no others. Every element of  $\ell$  can be expressed of the following type

$$a = \sum a_I I,$$

where  $I = i_{v_1} i_{v_2} \dots i_{v_p}$ ,  $1 \le v_1 < v_2 < \dots < v_p$ ,  $p \le n$ , n is a fixed natural number depending on  $a, a_I \in \mathbb{R}$  are the coefficients and  $\sum_I a_I^2 < \infty$ . If  $I = \emptyset$ , then  $a_I$  is called the real part of a and denoted by Re(a); the remaining part is called the imaginary part of a and denoted by Im(a).

In  $\ell$ , the Euclidean norm is expressed by

$$|a| = \sqrt{\sum_{I} a_{I}^{2}} = \sqrt{|\text{Re}(a)|^{2} + |\text{Im}(a)|^{2}}.$$

The algebra  $\ell$  has three important involutions:

(1) "": replacing each  $i_k$   $(k \ge 1)$  of a by  $-i_k$ , we get a new number a'.  $a \mapsto a'$  is an isomorphism of  $\ell$ :

$$(ab)' = a'b', \quad (a+b)' = a' + b',$$

for  $a, b \in \ell$ .

(2) "\*": replacing each  $i_{v_1}i_{v_2}\dots i_{v_p}$  of a by  $i_{v_p}i_{v_{p-1}}\dots i_{v_1}$ . We know that  $a \mapsto a^*$  is an anti-isomorphism of  $\ell$ :

$$(ab)^* = b^*a^*, \quad (a+b)^* = b^* + a^*.$$

(3) "-":  $\bar{a} = (a^*)' = (a')^*$ . It is obvious that  $a \mapsto \bar{a}$  is also an antiisomorphism of  $\ell$ .

We refer to elements of the following type as vectors:

$$x = x_0 + x_1 i_1 + \dots + x_n i_n + \dots \in \ell.$$

The set of all such vectors is denoted by  $\ell_2$  and we let  $\overline{\ell_2} = \ell_2 \bigcup \{\infty\}$ . For any  $x \in \ell_2$ , we have  $x^* = x$  and  $\bar{x} = x'$ . For  $x, y \in \ell_2$ , the inner product  $(x \cdot y)$  of x and y is given by

$$(x \cdot y) = x_0 y_0 + x_1 y_1 + \dots + x_n y_n + \dots,$$

where  $x = x_0 + x_1 i_1 + \dots + x_n i_n + \dots$ ,  $y = y_0 + y_1 i_1 + \dots + y_n i_n + \dots$ Obviously, any nonzero vector x is invertible in  $\ell$  with  $x^{-1} = \frac{\bar{x}}{|x|^2}$ . The inverse of a vector is invertible too. Since any product of nonzero vectors is invertible, we conclude that any product of nonzero vectors is invertible in  $\ell$ . The set of products of finitely many nonzero vectors is a multiplicative group, called Clifford group and denoted by  $\Gamma$ .

**Definition 2.1.** If a matrix  $g = \begin{pmatrix} a & b \\ c & d \end{pmatrix}$  satisfies:

- (1)  $a, b, c, d \in \Gamma \cup \{0\},\$
- (2)  $\triangle(q) = ad^* bc^* = 1$ ,
- (3)  $ab^*$ ,  $d^*b$ ,  $cd^*$ ,  $c^*a \in \ell_2$ ,

then we call g a Clifford matrix in infinite dimension; the set of all such matrices is denoted by  $SL(\Gamma)$ .

Let

$$I = \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 \end{pmatrix}, g^{-1} = \begin{pmatrix} d^* & -b^* \\ -c^* & a^* \end{pmatrix}.$$

Obviously,  $gg^{-1} = g^{-1}g = I$ , that is,  $g^{-1}$  is the inverse of g. By a simple computation, we know that  $SL(\Gamma)$  is a multiplicative group of matrices.

For any  $g = \pm \begin{pmatrix} a & b \\ c & d \end{pmatrix} \in SL(\Gamma)$ , the corresponding mapping

$$g(x) = (ax+b)(cx+d)^{-1}$$

is a bijection of  $\overline{\ell_2}$  onto itself, which we call a Möbius transformation in infinite dimension. Correspondingly, the set of all such mappings is also a group, which is still denoted by  $SL(\Gamma)$ .

Now, we give a classification of the nontrivial elements of  $SL(\Gamma)$  as follows:

• f is loxodromic if it is conjugate in  $SL(\Gamma)$  to  $\begin{pmatrix} r\lambda & 0 \\ 0 & r^{-1}\lambda' \end{pmatrix}$ , where  $r \in \mathbb{R} \setminus \{\pm 1, 0\}, \ \lambda \in \Gamma \text{ and } |\lambda| = 1$ ; if  $\lambda = \pm 1$ , then f is called hyperbolic.

• f is parabolic if it is conjugate in  $SL(\Gamma)$  to  $\begin{pmatrix} a & b \\ 0 & a' \end{pmatrix}$ , where  $a, b \in \Gamma$ ,  $|a| = 1, b \neq 0$  and ab = ba'; if  $a = \pm 1$ , then f is called strictly parabolic.

• Otherwise we say f is *elliptic*.

**Definition 2.2.** For  $g = \begin{pmatrix} a & b \\ c & d \end{pmatrix} \in SL(\Gamma)$ , we define the trace of g as  $tr(g) = a + d^*$ .

For a nontrivial element  $g = \begin{pmatrix} a & b \\ c & d \end{pmatrix} \in SL(\Gamma)$ , if  $b^* = b$ ,  $c^* = c$  and  $tr(g) \in \mathbb{R}$ , then we call g vectorial.

For the trace, we have the following result (see [8]).

**Lemma 2.3.** Let  $g = \begin{pmatrix} a & b \\ c & d \end{pmatrix} \in SL(\Gamma)$ . Then Re(tr(g)) is invariant under conjugation.

The following two lemmas come from [8].

**Lemma 2.4.**  $g = \begin{pmatrix} a & b \\ c & d \end{pmatrix} \in SL(\Gamma) \ (c \neq 0)$  is hyperbolic if and only if  $tr(g) \in \mathbb{R}$ ,  $tr^2(g) > 4$  and  $c \in \ell_2$ . If g is hyperbolic, then the two fixed points of g are

$$u,v = -\frac{1}{2}(c^{-1}d - ac^{-1}) \pm \frac{1}{2}c^{-1}((a+d^*)^2 - 4)^{\frac{1}{2}}.$$

**Lemma 2.5.**  $g = \begin{pmatrix} a & b \\ 0 & d \end{pmatrix} \in SL(\Gamma) \ (b \neq 0)$  is hyperbolic if and only if  $tr(g) \in \mathbb{R}$ ,  $tr^2(g) > 4$  and  $b \in \ell_2$ . If g is hyperbolic, then the two fixed points of g are  $\infty$  and  $-b(a-d)^{-1}$ .

**Definition 2.6.** For a subgroup  $G \subset \operatorname{SL}(\Gamma)$ , we call G elementary if G has a finite G-orbit, that is, there exists a point  $x \in \overline{\ell_2}$  such that

$$G(x) = \{g(x)|g \in G\}$$

is finite; otherwise, we call G nonelementary.

We say that G is discrete if  $g, f_1, f_2, \dots \in G$  and  $f_i \to g$  imply  $f_i = g$  for all sufficiently large i. Otherwise, G is not discrete.

**Lemma 2.7.** Let  $f \in SL(\Gamma)$  be not elliptic, and let  $\theta : SL(\Gamma) \to SL(\Gamma)$  be defined by

$$\theta(g) = gfg^{-1}.$$

Suppose that there exists n such that  $\theta^n(g) = f$ , then the group  $\langle f, g \rangle$  generated by f and g is elementary.

**Proof.** Define  $g_0 = g$  and  $g_n = \theta^n(g)$ . So for some  $m \ge 0$ ,

$$g_{m+1} = g_m f g_m^{-1}.$$

Suppose first that f is parabolic. Since f has exactly one fixed point, we may assume that  $f(\infty) = \infty$ . As  $g_1, \ldots, g_n$  are conjugate to f, they are each parabolic and so have a unique fixed point. Thus if  $g_{r+1}$  fixes  $\infty$ , then so does  $g_r$ , where  $r \geq 0$ . As  $g_n(=f)$  fixes  $\infty$ , we deduce that each  $g_j$   $(j=0,1,\ldots,n)$  fixes  $\infty$ . This shows that  $\langle f,g \rangle$  is elementary.

Suppose now that f is loxodromic and the two fixed points of f are x and y. Clearly,  $g_1, \ldots, g_n$  each have exactly two fixed points. Now suppose that  $g_{r+1}$  fixes x and y (as does  $g_n$ ): then

$${x,y} = {g_r(x), g_r(y)}.$$

Since  $g_r$  cannot interchange x and y for  $r \ge 1$ , we know that if  $g_{r+1}$  fixes x and y, then so does  $g_r$  for  $r \ge 1$ . It follows that  $g_1, \ldots, g_n$  each fix x and y. This shows that f and g leave the set  $\{x,y\}$  invariant and so  $\langle f,g \rangle$  is elementary.  $\square$ 

#### 3. The main result and its proof

Now we come to state and prove our main result.

**Theorem 3.1.** Let  $f, g \in SL(\Gamma)$  such that f is hyperbolic and [f, g] is vectorial, and suppose that  $\langle f, g \rangle$  is discrete and nonelementary, then

(3.1) 
$$|\operatorname{tr}^{2}(f) - 4| + |\operatorname{tr}([f, g]) - 2| \ge 1.$$

**Proof.** By Lemmas 2.4, 2.5 and 2.3, we know that  $tr(f) \in \mathbb{R}$ , and tr(f) and tr([f,g]) are invariant under conjugation. Without loss of generality, we may assume that

$$f = \left( \begin{array}{cc} \tau & 0 \\ 0 & \tau^{-1} \end{array} \right), \quad g = \left( \begin{array}{cc} a & b \\ c & d \end{array} \right),$$

where  $\tau > 0$  and  $\tau \neq 1$ . Let  $\kappa$  denote the left side of relation (3.1) and suppose that (3.1) fails. Then

(3.2) 
$$\kappa = (\tau - \tau^{-1})^2 (1 + |bc|) < 1.$$

We let

$$g_0 = g$$
,  $g_{m+1} = g_m f g_m^{-1}$ ,  $g_m = \begin{pmatrix} a_m & b_m \\ c_m & d_m \end{pmatrix}$ ,  $m = 0, 1, \dots$ 

Then, we have

(3.3) 
$$a_{m+1} = \tau a_m d_m^* - \tau^{-1} b_m c_m^*,$$

$$b_{m+1} = (\tau^{-1} - \tau) a_m b_m^*,$$

$$c_{m+1} = -(\tau^{-1} - \tau) c_m d_m^*,$$

$$d_{m+1} = \tau^{-1} d_m a_m^* - \tau c_m b_m^*,$$

$$b_{m+1} c_{m+1}^* = -(\tau^{-1} - \tau)^2 (1 + b_m c_m^*) b_m c_m^*.$$

Let  $f:[0,+\infty)\longrightarrow [0,+\infty)$  be defined by

$$f(x) = x(1+x)(\tau^{-1} - \tau)^2.$$

Let  $r = (\tau^{-1} - \tau)^{-2} - 1$ . It is obvious that f(x) is an increasing function on  $[0, +\infty)$  such that  $f(x) \leq x$  on [0, r]. It follows from (3.2) that |bc| < r. The above facts and relations (3.3) show that

$$|b_{m+1}c_{m+1}^*| \le f(|b_mc_m^*|) \le \cdots \le f^{m+1}(|bc^*|) \le |bc^*|,$$

$$|b_{m+1}c_{m+1}^*| \le (\tau^{-1} - \tau)^2 (1 + |b_mc_m^*|) |b_mc_m^*|$$

$$\le (\tau^{-1} - \tau)^2 (1 + |bc^*|) |b_mc_m^*| = \kappa |b_mc_m^*|,$$

$$|b_{m+1}c_{m+1}^*| \le \kappa^{m+1} |bc|.$$

So

$$\lim_{m \to \infty} b_m c_m^* = 0, \quad \lim_{m \to \infty} a_m d_m^* = 1.$$

The above relation and (3.3) imply that

$$\lim_{m \to \infty} a_m = \tau, \quad \lim_{m \to \infty} d_m = \tau^{-1}.$$

Now

$$|b_m^{-1}b_{m+1}| = |(\tau^{-1} - \tau)a_m^*| \to |\tau(\tau^{-1} - \tau)| < \sqrt{\kappa}\tau.$$

So for sufficiently large m, we have

$$\left| \frac{b_{m+1}}{\tau^{m+1}} \right| \le \sqrt{\kappa} \left| \frac{b_m}{\tau^m} \right|.$$

It follows that

$$\left|\frac{b_m}{\tau^m}\right| \to 0.$$

In a very similar way, we get that

$$\lim_{m \to \infty} c_m \tau^m = 0.$$

It follows that

$$\lim_{m \to \infty} f^{-m} g_{2m} f^m = f.$$

Since  $\langle f, g \rangle$  is discrete, we must have  $g_{2m} = f$  for some m. By Lemma 2.7,  $\langle f, g \rangle$  must be elementary, which violates the assumption. The contradiction shows that  $\kappa$  cannot be less than 1.

**Remark 3.2.** Theorem 3.1 is a generalization of Theorem B in [4] and the corresponding result in [11].

### 4. An application

For 
$$f_r = \begin{pmatrix} a_r & b_r \\ c_r & d_r \end{pmatrix}$$
, where  $a_r, b_r, c_r, d_r \in \Gamma \cup \{0\}$  and  $r = 1, 2$ , define 
$$\|f_r\| = \sqrt{|a_r|^2 + |b_r|^2 + |c_r|^2 + |d_r|^2},$$
 
$$\|f_1 - f_2\| = \sqrt{|a_1 - a_2|^2 + |b_1 - b_2|^2 + |c_1 - c_2|^2 + |d_1 - d_2|^2}.$$

Then

**Lemma 4.1** ([7]). For any 
$$U = \begin{pmatrix} a & b \\ -b' & a' \end{pmatrix} \in SL(\Gamma)$$
 ( $U$  is called unitary),  $g = \begin{pmatrix} \alpha & \beta \\ \gamma & \delta \end{pmatrix}$ , we have  $||g|| = ||gU|| = ||Ug||$ , where  $\alpha$ ,  $\beta$ ,  $\gamma$ ,  $\delta \in \Gamma \cup \{0\}$ .

**Lemma 4.2.** Let  $f \in SL(\Gamma)$  be hyperbolic. Then

$$||f - I||^2 \ge \frac{1}{2} |\operatorname{tr}^2(f) - 4|.$$

**Proof.** Since ||f - I|| and  $\operatorname{tr}^2(f)$  are invariant under conjugation by unitary transformations by Lemmas 2.3, 2.4, 2.5 and 4.1, without loss of generality, we may assume that

$$f = \left(\begin{array}{cc} u & 0\\ 0 & u^{-1} \end{array}\right),$$

where u > 1. By a simple computation, the conclusion follows.

**Lemma 4.3.** Let  $f,g \in SL(\Gamma)$  be hyperbolic such that [f,g] is vectorial. Then

$$||f - I||^2 \cdot ||g - I||^2 \ge |\operatorname{tr}([f, g]) - 2|.$$

**Proof.** Since the two sides of the above inequality are invariant under conjugation by unitary transformations, we may assume that

$$f = \left( \begin{array}{cc} u & 0 \\ 0 & u^{-1} \end{array} \right), \ g = \left( \begin{array}{cc} a & b \\ c & d \end{array} \right),$$

where u > 1. By computation, we see that

$$[f,g] = \left( \begin{array}{cc} ad^* - u^2bc^* & (u^2-1)ab^* \\ (u^{-2}-1)cd^* & da^* - u^{-2}cb^* \end{array} \right), \quad |\mathrm{tr}([f,g]) - 2| = (u-u^{-1})^2|bc^*|,$$

$$||f - I||^2 \cdot ||g - I||^2 = [(u - 1)^2 + (u^{-1} - 1)^2][|a - 1|^2 + |b|^2 + |c|^2 + |d - 1|^2].$$
 Therefore, we have

$$||f - I||^2 \cdot ||g - I||^2 \ge (u - u^{-1})^2 |bc| = |\operatorname{tr}([f, g]) - 2|.$$

We will use Theorem 3.1 to prove

**Theorem 4.4.** Let  $f, g \in SL(\Gamma)$  be hyperbolic such that [f, g] and [g, f] are vectorial. If  $\langle f, g \rangle$  is discrete and nonelementary, then

$$||f - I|| \cdot ||g - I|| \ge \sqrt{2} - 1.$$

**Proof.** Let  $x = \min\{|\operatorname{tr}^2(f) - 4|, |\operatorname{tr}^2(g) - 4|\}.$ 

We first suppose that  $x \leq 2\sqrt{2} - 2$ . By assumptions and Theorem 3.1,

$$|\operatorname{tr}^2(f) - 4| + |\operatorname{tr}([f, g]) - 2| \ge 1, \quad |\operatorname{tr}^2(g) - 4| + |\operatorname{tr}([g, f]) - 2| \ge 1.$$

Therefore, by Lemma 4.3, we have that

$$||f - I||^2 \cdot ||g - I||^2 \ge |\operatorname{tr}([f, g]) - 2| \ge 1 - |\operatorname{tr}^2(f) - 4|,$$

and

$$||g - I||^2 \cdot ||f - I||^2 \ge |\operatorname{tr}([g, f]) - 2| \ge 1 - |\operatorname{tr}^2(g) - 4|.$$

Thus,

$$||f - I||^2 \cdot ||g - I||^2 \ge 1 - (2\sqrt{2} - 2) = (\sqrt{2} - 1)^2.$$

Now we suppose that  $x \ge 2\sqrt{2} - 2$ . By Lemma 4.2, we have

$$||f - I||^2 \ge \frac{1}{2} |\operatorname{tr}^2(f) - 4|, ||g - I||^2 \ge \frac{1}{2} |\operatorname{tr}^2(g) - 4|.$$

We hence know that

$$||f - I||^2 \cdot ||g - I||^2 \ge \frac{1}{4} |\operatorname{tr}^2(f) - 4| |\operatorname{tr}^2(g) - 4| \ge (\sqrt{2} - 1)^2.$$

#### References

- [1] AHLFORS, LARS V. On the fixed points of Möbius transformations in  $\mathbb{R}^n$ . Ann. Acad. Sci. Fenn. Ser. A I Math. 10 (1985), 15–27. MR0802464 (87c:20086), Zbl 0586.30045.
- Beardon, Alan F. The geometry of discrete groups. Graduate Texts in Mathematics, 91. Springer-Verlag, New York, 1983. xii+337 pp. ISBN: 0-387-90788-2. MR0698777 (85d:22026), Zbl 0528.30001.
- [3] FRUNZĂ, MONICA. Möbius transformations in infinite dimension. Analyse complexe (Bucharest, 1989). Rev. Roumaine Math. Pures. Appl. 36 (1991), 369–376. MR1144568 (93a:58016), Zbl 0753.30035.
- [4] Hersonsky, Sa'ar. A generalization of the Shimizu–Leutbecher and Jørgensen inequalities to Möbius transformations in  $\mathbb{R}^N$ . Proc. Amer. Math. Soc. **121** (1994), 209–215. MR1182701 (94m:30085), Zbl 0812.30017.
- [5] JØRGENSEN, TROELS. On discrete groups of Möbius transformations. Amer. J. Math. 98 (1976), 739–749. MR0427627 (55 #658), Zbl 0336.30007.
- [6] LEUTBECHER, ARMIN. Über Spitzen diskontinuierlicher Gruppen von lineargebrochenen Transformationen. Math. Z. 100 (1967), 183–200. MR0214763 (35 #5612), Zbl 0157.13502.
- [7] LI, LIULAN. A class of Möbius transformations in infinite dimension. (Chinese. English summary.) J. Nat. Sci. Jiangxi Norm. Univ. 33 (2009), 556–559. Zbl pre05812476.
- [8] LI, LIULAN; WANG, XIANTAO. On Möbius transformations in infinite dimension. (Chinese. English summary.) J. Nat. Sci. Heilongjiang Univ. 22 (2005), 497–500. MR2175830, Zbl 1087.30041.
- [9] Ohtake, Hiromi. On the discontinous subgroups with parabolic transformations of the Möbius groups. J. Math. Kyoto Uni. 25 (1985), 807–816. Zbl 0599.30071.
- [10] Shimizu, Hideo. On discontinuous groups operating on the product of the upper half planes. Ann. Math. 77 (1963), 33–71. MR0145106 (26 #2641), Zbl 0218.10045.

- [11] WANG, XIANTAO. Generalizations of Shimizu-Leutbecher inequality and Jørgensen inequality to high dimensional Möbius groups. Chinese Sci. Bull. 22 (1996), 2109– 2110
- [12] WATERMAN, P. L. Möbius transformations in several dimensions. Adv. Math. 101 (1993), 87–113. MR1239454 (95h:30056), Zbl 0793.15019.
- [13] Wielenberg, Norbert J. Discrete Moebius groups: Fundamental polyhedra and convergence. Amer. J. Math.  $\bf 99$  (1977), 861–877. MR0477035 (57 #16579), Zbl 0373.57024.

DEPARTMENT OF MATHEMATICS AND COMPUTATIONAL SCIENCE, HENGYANG NORMAL UNIVERSITY, HENGYANG, HUNAN 421008, PEOPLE'S REPUBLIC OF CHINA lanlimail2008@yahoo.com.cn

This paper is available via http://nyjm.albany.edu/j/2011/17-3.html.